



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

11/5

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/736,293	12/16/2003	Mustansir Banatwala	LOT9-2003-0103-US1 (7321-	3780
46321 7590 02/21/2007 CAREY, RODRIGUEZ, GREENBERG & PAUL, LLP STEVEN M. GREENBERG 950 PENINSULA CORPORATE CIRCLE SUITE 3020 BOCA RATON, FL 33487			EXAMINER ANWARI, MACEEH	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
			2109	

SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD OF RESPONSE	MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE
3 MONTHS	02/21/2007	PAPER

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire 6 MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.

Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/736,293

Applicant(s)

BANATWALA ET AL.

Examiner

Maceeh Anwari

Art Unit

2109

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 16 December 2003.
- 2a) ☐ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☒ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-13 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-13 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☒ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
- 6) ☐ Other: _____

DETAILED ACTION

This is the initial Office action based on the 10/736,293 application filed December 16, 2003. Claims 1-13, as originally filed are currently pending and have become considered below.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 101

1. 35 U.S.C. 101 reads as follows:

Whoever invents or discovers any new and useful process, machine, manufacture, or composition of matter, or any new and useful improvement thereof, may obtain a patent therefor, subject to the conditions and requirements of this title.

Claims 1-13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 101 because the claimed invention is directed to non-statutory subject matter. Claims 1-4 and 13 do not fall within at least one of the four statutory categories of patent eligible subject matter; rather what the applicant has disclosed within these claims is interpreted as being software per se.

Claims 1-13 fall under a judicial exception, an abstract idea, and are not directed to a practical application of such a judicial exception because they fail to produce a tangible result.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

1. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless –

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Art Unit: 2109

2. Claims 1-13 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being clearly anticipated by Fredell et al. (hereinafter Fredell), U.S. PGPUB NO.: US 2001/0028364 A1.

Fredell teaches:

Claim 1:

A discussion forum resource comprising (Par.108; reads on the limitation of a discussion forum): at least one topic thread disposed in the discussion resource forum and created for externally sourced content in the discussion forum resource (Figure 1 & Par. 2 Lines 1-10 & Par. 122); and, a data aggregator coupled to said at least one topic thread and configured to manage said externally sourced content in said at least one topic thread (Figure 1 & Par. 2 & Par.107).

Claim 2:

The discussion forum resource of claim 1, wherein said externally sourced content comprise data selected from the group consisting of text, audio, imagery and video (Figure 2 & 3 & Par. 43 Lines 11-15).

Claim 3:

The discussion forum resource of claim 1, wherein said externally sourced content comprise postings for another discussion forum resource (Figure 4 & Par. 36 Lines 7-9 & Par. 37

Lines 9-13 & Par. 109; reads on the limitation of alternate discussion forums).

Claim 4:

The discussion forum resource of claim 3, wherein said data aggregator further comprises a configuration for writing responsive postings in said at least one topic thread disposed in the discussion forum resource to said another discussion forum resource (Figure 1 & 4 & Par. 36 Lines 7-9 & Par. 37 Lines 9-13 & Par. 109 & Par. 107-110; reads on the limitation of alternate discussion forums and being able to write to them).

Claim 5:

A discussion forum management method comprising the steps of (Par.108; reads on the limitation of a discussion forum): receiving externally sourced data for posting in a discussion forum resource (Figure 1 & Par. 2 Lines 1-10 & Par. 122); creating a new topic thread for said externally sourced data (Figure 4 & Par. 114; reads on the limitation of new topic threads); and, permitting responsive postings to said externally sourced data in said new topic thread (Par. 110).

Claim 6:

The method of claim 5, further comprising the steps of: determining whether subsequently received postings are responsive postings which relate to said externally sourced data;

and, posting said subsequently received postings to said external data source if it is determined that said subsequently received postings are responsive postings which relate to said externally sourced data (Par. 11 Lines 5-20 & Par.110; it is inherent that in order for the invention to provide notifications when a response is issued it would have to be able to determine whether the received posting is a responsive posting or not).

Claim 7:

The method of claim 5, wherein said externally sourced data comprises data selected from the group consisting of text, audio, imagery and video (Figure 2 & 3 & Par. 43 Lines 11-15).

Claim 8:

The method of claim 5, wherein said externally sourced data comprises postings for another discussion forum resource (Figure 4 & Par. 36 Lines 7-9 & Par. 37 Lines 9-13 & Par. 109; reads on the limitation of alternate discussion forums).

Claim 9:

A machine readable storage having stored thereon a computer program for discussion forum management (Par.108; reads on the limitation of a discussion forum), the computer program comprising a routine set of instructions which when executed by a machine cause the machine to perform the steps of: receiving externally sourced data for posting in a discussion forum

Art Unit: 2109

resource (Figure 1 & Par. 2 Lines 1-10 & Par. 122); creating a new topic thread for said externally sourced data (Figure 4 & Par. 114; reads on the limitation of new topic threads); and, permitting responsive postings to said externally sourced data in said new topic thread (Par. 110).

Claim 10:

The machine readable storage of claim 9, further comprising the steps of: determining whether subsequently received postings are responsive postings which relate to said externally sourced data; and, posting said subsequently received postings to said external data source if it is determined that said subsequently received postings are responsive postings which relate to said externally sourced data (Par. 11 Lines 5-20 & Par.110; it is inherent that in order for the invention to provide notifications when a response is issued it would have to be able to determine whether the received posting is a responsive posting or not).

Claim 11:

The machine readable storage of claim 9, wherein said externally sourced data comprises data selected from the group consisting of text, audio, imagery and video (Figure 2 & 3 & Par. 43 Lines 11-15).

Claim 12:

Art Unit: 2109

The machine readable storage of claim 9, wherein said externally sourced data comprises postings for another discussion forum resource (Figure 4 & Par. 36 Lines 7-9 & Par. 37 Lines 9-13 & Par. 109; reads on the limitation of alternate discussion forums).

Claim 13:

A collaborative environment configured to include external data sources in a discussion forum resource comprising: at least two discussion forum resources coupled to each other (Figure 4 & Par. 36 Lines 7-9 & Par. 37 Lines 9-13 & Par. 109; reads on the limitation of alternate/multiple discussion forums); and, a data aggregator disposed between said at least two discussion forum resources (Figure 1 & Par. 114; reads on the limitation of there being a data aggregator) and configured to synchronize postings related to one another in said at least two discussion forum resources (Par. 110 & 120 & 121; the limitation of synchronization is inherent when notifications are made available upon cue).


Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Maceeh Anwari whose telephone number is 571-272-7591. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Friday 7:30-5:00 PM ES.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Joe Del Sole can be reached on 571-272-1130. The fax

Art Unit: 2109

phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.


JOSEPH DEL SOLE
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
2/16/07